The Mediterranean World

[301] Of the many authors who have written on the medieval Mediterranean world as an interacting system of societies and cultures, two have produced works of particular merit for the interweaving of economic and cultural themes. S. D. Goitein's many studies based on the documentation originally contained in the Cairo Geniza have proved of enormous utility in establishing the economic system of the Islamic world of the high middle ages, as well as illuminating many aspects of medieval technology, society, and culture which, although based on material of Jewish provenance, still provide an accurate reflection of a generalized culture shared by the urban middle class throughout the Islamic world. Goitein himself notes the paucity of Spanish economic documents in the Geniza collections, a lack which is surprising in view of the prominent share which Andalusi wares held in Islamic Mediterranean markets. The lack of documentation seems to have reflected the association of Andalusi Jews with the Babylonian synagogue in Cairo, whereas the Geniza documents emanated from the Palestinian congregation. Nevertheless, enough Spanish material intrudes itself to suggest that the patterns described were as typical of Andalusi as of North African society. Of relevance to Spain is *A Mediterranean Society*, of which two volumes (of a projected three) have appeared thus far. The first -- *Economic Foundations* (Berkeley, 1967) -- contains much material relevant to Andalusi participation in the Islamic world economy, as well as to the store of techniques common to all countries of the Islamic Mediterranean. The second volume -- *The Community* (Berkeley, 1971) -- contains information on the position of ethnic minorities in the Islamic world, directly relevant to the Andalusi situation, which was, of course, faithful to norms general throughout Islam. In *Letters of Medieval Jewish Traders* (Princeton, 1973), Goitein provides translations of a number of Andalus' documents, plus numerous passing references to Spanish commercial products which provide a vivid enough picture of the place of al-Andalus in a wider commercial framework. Also important for the general economic and cultural background [302] of the period are Goitein's *Studies in Islamic History and Institutions* (Leiden, 1966).

The works of Maurice Lombard also relate to the place of Spain, particularly Islamic Spain, in the medieval economy. His collected essays, *Éspaces et réseaux du haut moyen âge* (Paris-The Hague, 1972), deal with general economic history, but always within an explicit geographical framework wherein the axial role of Spain is clear. Of particular significance is his discussion of the timber trade, wood having been the primary energy source of medieval technology. His more popular book, *L'Islam dans sa première grandeur (VIIIe-XIe siècle)* (Paris, 1971), also highlights al-Andalus as an integral sector of the medieval Islamic world.

The Iberian Middle Ages

The disjunction between Islamic and medieval studies in the Spanish academic tradition has meant that works of a general nature usually survey one culture or the other: there is no survey covering both
Christian and Islamic Spain written by an Islamist and those written by medievalists tend to give inadequate coverage to Islamic society.

A number of recent works stress social or cultural continuities spanning the Islamic conquest of 711. Harold Livermore, *The Origins of Spain and Portugal* (London, 1971), views both Visigothic and Islamic political organization as embroiderings of Roman themes. A. Barbero and M. Vigil, *Sobre los orígenes sociales de la reconquista* (Barcelona, 1974), stress the continuity between Cantabro-Basque tribal structure and the emergent societies of the western Christian kingdoms. Ignacio Olagüe, in a book which first appeared in French with the provocative title *Les arabes n'ont jamais envahi l'Espagne* (Paris, 1969), asserted that there was no true invasion but rather a rapid, mass conversion of Hispano-Romans to Islam, a religion in harmony with supposedly dominant theological trends of a unitarian (i.e., adoptionist) nature. A Spanish version appeared later, with the footnotes that were lacking in the original and a new title: *La revolución islámica en occidente* (Barcelona, 1974). See Pierre Guichard's response, "Les arabes ont bien envahi l'Espagne: Les structures sociales de l'Espagne musulmane," *Annales*, 29 (1974), 1483-1513. Although Olagüe's views on conversion and social structure cannot be taken seriously, his comments on historical climatology are interesting and well-informed.


**Al-Andalus**

Two recent histories of Spanish Arabism make it clear that before the present decade there was virtually no social history of al-Andalus, previous workers in the field having concentrated almost wholly on narrative political history and on various aspects of Islamic culture, particularly literature and philosophy. These studies are James T. Monroe, *Islam and the Arabs in Spanish Scholarship* (Leiden, 1970), and Manuela Manzanares de Cirre, *Arabistas españoles del siglo XIX* (Madrid, 1972).

The standard history of al-Andalus through the fall of the Caliphate is E. Lévi-Provençal, *España musulmana hasta la caída del califato de Córdoba*, trans. E. García Gómez, 2nd ed. (Madrid, 1957) published as volume IV of *Historia de España* directed by Ramón Menéndez Pidal. Volume V of the same series includes "Instituciones y vida social e intelectual," by Lévi-Provençal -- an updated version of *L'Espagne musulmane au Xème siècle* (Paris, 1932) - and "Arte califal" by Leopoldo Torres Balbás. Lévi-Provençal's narrative, drawn from Arabic chronicles, is still useful, but he did not fully appreciate the tribal nature of Andalusi society in the eighth and ninth centuries, nor was he able to describe accurately the mechanism of conversion and its rate.


The entire countenance of Andalusi studies has been altered substantially by the publication of Pierre Guichard's Al-Andalus: Estructura antropológlca de una sociedad islámica en occidente (Barcelona, 1976). Heretofore no scholar had grasped the tribal nature of Andalusi society, particularly in its first two centuries, as a result of which the social structure was misunderstood and misrepresented. Moreover, in attacking the thesis of cultural continuity between pre- and post-711 Hispanic societies, Guichard is able to demonstrate that Umayyad society in Spain was a normative Islamic one in which indigenous elements were assimilated to dominant Arab-Berber norms and not the reverse.


The place of Berber Culture and society in medieval Spain is now receiving its just share of attention. On settlement, see Bosch Vilá, "El elemento humano norteafricano en la historia de la España musulmana," Cuadernos de la Biblioteca Española de Tetuán, 2 (1964), 17-37; Guichard, "Le peuplement de la région de Valencia aux deux premiers siècles de la domination musulmane," Mélanges de la Casa de Velazquez, 5 (1969), 103-156; and Jaime Oliver Asín, "En torno a los orígenes de Castilla," Al-Andalus, 38 (1973), 319-391. The last two studies are inventive attempts to reconstruct early patterns of Berber settlement (in Valencia and Old Castile, respectively), primarily on the basis of placenames.


On the development of Andalusi culture, with emphasis on the contributions to it of Arabia, Egypt, and Iraq, there is the seminal work of Mahmûd 'Ali Makkî, Ensayo sobre las aportaci- ones orientales en la España musulmana y su influencia en la formación de la cultura hispano-árabe (Madrid, 1968). Makkî's work bears the same relation to cultural history as Guichard's does to social history, since it

**Christian Spain**


The absence of studies of ecclesiastical domains had formed one of the major lacunae in medieval Spanish economic history. In the last decade, however, numerous domain studies have appeared. Among the most useful are Eufemia Fort i Cogul, *El senyoriu de Santes Creus* (Barcelona, 1972); Jose Angel Garcia de Cortazar, *El dominio del monasterio de San Millan de la Cogolla* (siglos X a XIII) (Salamanca, 1969); and Salustiano Moreta Velayos, *El monasterio de San Pedro de Cardeña: Historia de un dominio monástico castellano* (902-1338) (Salamanca, 1971). Also interesting, but with less economic content, are Justiniano Rodriguez Fernandez, *El monasterio de Ardon* (Leon, 1964); Maria del Carmen Pallares and Ermelindo Portela Silva, *El bajo valle del Miño en los siglos XII y XIII* (Santiago de Compostela, 1971); and Maria del Pilar Yanez Cifuentes, *El monasterio de Santiago de Leon* (Barcelona, 1972).


On French settlement and influence, see Marcelin Defourneaux, *Les français en Espagne au Xle et XIIe siècles* (Paris, 1949); Manuel Alvar, "Historia y linguística: Colonización franca en Aragón,"
Urbanism

A survey of the entire peninsula is E. A. Gutkind, *Urban Development in Southern Europe: Spain and Portugal* (New York, 1967). This volume is especially valuable for its reproductions of town maps, but the critical apparatus is incomplete. The structure and functions of Andalusi cities have been studied in numerous articles by Leopoldo Torres Balbás. A synthesis of his work, based almost wholly on previously published articles, was published posthumously under the editorship of Henri Terrasse as *Ciudades hispanomusulmanas*, 2 vols. (Madrid, no date), but the footnotes have been stripped down from their original form to the extent that references are difficult to follow. Therefore, the original articles are preferred. See, in particular, "Plazas, zocos y tiendas de las ciudades hispanomusulmanas," *Al-Andalus*, 12 (1947), 437-476; "Los contornos de las ciudades hispanomusulmanas," *ibid.*, 15 (1950), 437-486; "Estructura de las ciudades hispanomusulmanas: La medina, los arrabales y los barrios," [310] *ibid.*, 8 (1953), 149-177; and "Extensión y demografía de las ciudades hispano musulmanas," *Studia Islamica*, 3 (1955), 35-59.


Technology


**Science**

The history of science in medieval Spain was pioneered by José María Millá Vallicrosa, whose shorter monographs are collected in two volumes, *Estudios sobre historia de la ciencia española* (Barcelona, 1949), and *Nuevos estudios sobre historia de la ciencia española* (Barcelona, [312] 1960). Much of his later work was presaged in his important study of the Arabic sources of science at the tenth-century monastery of Ripoll, *Assaig d'història de les idees físisques i matemàtiques a la Catalunya medieval* (Barcelona, 1931). Also, see his studies of Andalusi astronomy and the translation movement, *Estudios sobre Azarquiel* (Madrid-Granada, 1943-1950), and *Las traducciones orientales en los manuscritos de la Biblioteca Catedral de Toledo* (Madrid, 1942). For a critical appreciation of Millá's work, see Thomas F. Glick, "José María Millás Vallicrosa and the Founding of the History of Science in Spain," *Isis*, 68 (1977), 276-283. Millá's interest in the practice of science in al-Andalus is continued by his disciple Juan Vernet. See his study, "La ciencia en el Islam y Occidente," in *L'Occidente e l'Islam nell'alto medioevo*, vol. II (Spoleto, 1965), pp. 537-572, the relevant chapters of his *Historia de la ciencia española* (Madrid, 1975), and his articles on Andalusi scientific figures in the *Dictionary of Scientific Biography*, 14 vols. to date (New York, 1970- ). For a comprehensive study of the Andalusi aeronomical school, see Lucie Bolens' perceptive analysis, *Les méthodes culturales au moyen-âge d'après les traités d'agronomie andalou: Traditions et techniques* (Geneva, 1974).


**Philology and Linguistics**


There are numerous studies of historically significant place-names. Among the most useful are Miguel Asín Palacios, *Contribución a la toponimia árabe de España*, 2nd ed. (Madrid, 1944); Arnald Steiger, *Toponimia árabe de Murcia* (Murcia, 1958); Juan Vernet, "Toponimia arábiga," in *Enciclopedia Lingüística Hispánica*, vol. I (Madrid, 1960), pp. 561-578; and Francisco Marsá, "Toponimia de roconquista," *ibid.*, pp. 615-646. Hermann Lautensach, *Maurische Züge im geographischen Bild der Iberischen Halbinsel* (Bonn, 1960), is a study of the geographical distribution of Arabic place-names.

**The Polemic of Spanish History**

Américo Castro's great work, which first appeared under the title *España en su historia (Cristianos, moros y judios)* (Buenos Aires, 1948), subsequently was reelaborated in successive editions in Spanish and English, each one of which reflected further elaborations of the theme. The next stage was represented by *La realidad histórica de España* (Mexico City, 1954), which included a number of new and rewritten chapters and appeared in English as *The Structure of Spanish History* (Princeton, 1954). Reviews of the 1954 editions were collected under the title *La realidad histórica de España: Juicios y comentarios* (Mexico City, 1957). *Realidad* reappeared in a much revised version, the *edición renovada* of 1962, on which was based the final elaboration which appeared in English as *The Spaniards* (Berkeley, 1971). Among the critical commentaries on Castro's work are Guillermo Araya, *Evolución del pensamiento histórico de Américo Castro* (Madrid, 1969) and José Luis Gómez-

Although the brunt of Castro's argument fell in an area which has been a major topic of anthropological discussion for fifty years -- acculturation -- he spawned a generation of intellectual historians who were illiterate in the social sciences and as a result have been unable over the past twenty-five years to advance the discussion much past Castro's original insight. See for example the volume of *Collected Studies in Honour of Americo Castro's 80th Year* (Oxford, 1965), where none of the authors seems able to deal with cross-cultural problems at a conceptual level. On the relevance of acculturation studies, see Thomas F. Glick and Oriol Pi-Sunyer, "Acculturation as an Explanatory Concept in Spanish History," *Comparative Studies in Society and History*, II (1969), 136-154. The major research breakthroughs in this period have originated with [315] Arabists who were knowledgeable in Romance material -- for example, S. M. Stern's work on poetry; J. M. Millás Vallicrosa in the history of science; P. Chalmeta on economic institutions.

Sánchez-Albornoz's reply to Castro was *España: Un enigma histórico*, 2 vols. (Buenos Aires, 1956). It is this work, permeated with his notions of "temperamental inheritance," that I have found fault with in the present book. His institutional studies, by contrast, are relatively free from the same kind of bias, at least overtly. Yet, Sánchez-Albornoz's approach to Arabic documentation is so bizarre that it must cast doubt on his interpretations of source material. Pedro Chalmeta has rightly noted that his hypercritical method of analyzing Arabic texts is inappropriate inasmuch as he relies upon translations. For examples, see the sections devoted to Arabic historiography in *Investigaciones sobre historiografía hispana medieval (Siglos VIII al XII)* (Buenos Aires, 1967). But the problem lies not only with his method of textual analysis but with questionable assumptions regarding the nature of Arabic sources themselves. He asserts that, for example, the early sources concerning the Islamic invasion were written by non-Hispanized Arabs who were prone to accept fables as true, while the later chronicles were infused with realism and reason because they were written by "Islamic historians, either of Spanish origin or already saturated with Hispanism." I cannot accept a genetic criterion for historiographical probity.

A relatively objective essay on Romance elements in Andalusi culture and Christian borrowing of Islamic elements, *El islam de España y el occidente* (Madrid, 1974), was originally presented by Sánchez-Albornoz at the Spoleto seminar on the high middle ages in 1964 (L'Occidente e l'Islam nell'alto medioevo, Spoleto, 1965, pp. 149-308). In the discussion of this presentation, S. M. Stern took strong exception, not to Sánchez-Albornoz's data, but to the conclusions drawn from them. Stern questioned the logic of taking individual traits as representative of a "Spanish genetic heritage," recalling that Islamic civilization in Iran was likewise inflected with elements of a local culture. To this, Sánchez-Albornoz replied that Stern had erred in neglecting "as unworthy of a historian the study of the projection of the idiosyncratic heredity of each historical community within the national line." Sánchez-Albornoz's latest polemical volume, *El drama de la formación de España y los españoles: Otra nueva aventura polémica* (Barcelona, 1973), seems to have been stimulated by the steady erosion of a once unanimous consensus of medieval-ists [316] in his favor, such defections here identified as seductions by Castro's deformed ideas. He notes with alarm the intrusion of Castro's influences in recent works (p. 12), recites (as if to refute Castro one final time) another list of indelibly "Spanish" traits (p. 24), and then concludes that Castro's madness was owing to his "Jewish ancestry" (pp. 98, 104). Sánchez-Albornoz's work is surveyed by José-Luis Martín, "El occidente español en la alta edad media según los trabajos de Sánchez-Albornoz," *Anuario de Estudlos Medievales*, 4 (1967), 599-611.
Notes for the Bibliography